

**Review Form To Assess Whether an Intervention is Backed by Strong Evidence of Effectiveness (i.e., meets the Congressional “Top Tier” Evidence Standard)**

**The Congressionally-based Top Tier evidence standard is:** *Interventions shown in well-designed and implemented randomized controlled trials, preferably conducted in typical community settings, to produce sizeable, sustained benefits to participants and/or society.*

**The standard for Near Top Tier is:** *Interventions shown to meet all elements of the Top Tier standard in a single site, and which only need one additional step to qualify as Top Tier – a replication trial to confirm the initial findings and establish that they generalize to other sites.*

**1. Name of Intervention you reviewed:** ABC Program to Improve Lives

Study 1 (Smith et. al. 2004)

Study 2 (Jones et. al. 2009)

**2. For each randomized controlled trial (RCT) of this intervention, please assess whether the RCT is “well-designed and implemented” [using the short RCT checklist \(linked here\) as a reference.](#)**

Specifically, please rate the RCT on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being strongest, 1 being weakest) on the following categories in the checklist:

	Study 1 Rating	Study 2 Rating
<p><b>Overall study design.</b> Please give one composite rating based on items on p. 3 of checklist, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Random assignment conducted at appropriate level (e.g., groups vs. individuals)</li> <li>▪ Adequate sample size</li> </ul>		
<p><b>Intervention and control groups remained equivalent.</b> Please give one composite rating based on items on p. 4 of checklist, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Few or no baseline differences between T and C groups</li> <li>▪ Minimal cross-over, or contamination, between T and C</li> <li>▪ Outcome data collected in same way, at same time, for T and C</li> <li>▪ Low sample attrition and/or differential attrition</li> <li>▪ Sample members kept in original group assignment (T or C), consistent with intent-to-treat</li> </ul>		
<p><b>Study’s outcome measures.</b> Please give one composite rating based on items on pp. 4-5 of checklist, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Valid outcome measures</li> <li>▪ Outcome measures of policy or practical importance</li> <li>▪ Where appropriate, those collecting outcome data were blinded</li> <li>▪ Outcomes were measured over a sufficiently long time period</li> </ul>		
<p><b>Study’s reporting of the intervention’s effects.</b> Please give one composite rating based on items on pp. 5-6 of checklist, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Study reports size of effects, and its tests for statistical significance account for study design features (e.g., random assignment of groups vs. individuals)</li> <li>▪ Study reports effects on all outcomes measured</li> </ul>		

Comment briefly on the reasons behind your ratings (please continue on a separate sheet if needed):

**2. Assess whether the body of evidence from the RCTs meets the conditions of the Top Tier evidence standard.**

Specifically, please rate the body of evidence on a scale of 1 to 5 (5 being strongest, 1 being weakest) on the following categories:

	Rating:
<b>Does the body of evidence constitute strong evidence about the intervention's effects, preferably in typical community settings?</b> Please give one composite rating based on items in the checklist Appendix (p. 6), including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Intervention found to be effective in more than one implementation site (e.g., 2+ RCTs or a large multi-site RCT)</li><li>▪ The RCTs preferably evaluated the intervention in typical community settings</li><li>▪ No strong countervailing evidence was found</li></ul>	
<b>Does the body of evidence show <u>sizeable</u> effects on important outcomes?</b>	
<b>Does the body of evidence show <u>sustained</u> effects on important outcomes?</b>	

Comment briefly on the reasons behind your ratings (please continue on a separate sheet if needed):

**3. Based on your ratings and comments above, do you believe this intervention meets the Top Tier evidence standard shown at the beginning of this form? Yes / No**

**4. If your answer is no, do you believe this intervention meets the Near Top Tier evidence standard shown at the beginning of this form? Yes / No**